

1998

The Making of an AIDS Quilt Panel: A Burkean Pentadic Analysis

Stephanie J. Poole

Eastern Illinois University

This research is a product of the graduate program in [Speech Communication](#) at Eastern Illinois University.

[Find out more](#) about the program.

Recommended Citation

Poole, Stephanie J., "The Making of an AIDS Quilt Panel: A Burkean Pentadic Analysis" (1998). *Masters Theses*. 1776.
<https://thekeep.eiu.edu/theses/1776>

This is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Theses & Publications at The Keep. It has been accepted for inclusion in Masters Theses by an authorized administrator of The Keep. For more information, please contact tabruns@eiu.edu.

THESIS REPRODUCTION CERTIFICATE

TO: Graduate Degree Candidates (who have written formal theses)

SUBJECT: Permission to Reproduce Theses

The University Library is receiving a number of request from other institutions asking permission to reproduce dissertations for inclusion in their library holdings. Although no copyright laws are involved, we feel that professional courtesy demands that permission be obtained from the author before we allow these to be copied.

PLEASE SIGN ONE OF THE FOLLOWING STATEMENTS:

Booth Library of Eastern Illinois University has my permission to lend my thesis to a reputable college or university or the purpose of copying it for inclusion in that institution's library or research holdings.

Author's Signature

7/27/98

Date

I respectfully request Booth Library of Eastern Illinois University **NOT** allow my thesis to be reproduced because:

Author's Signature

Date

Running head: THE MAKING OF AN AIDS QUILT PANEL

The Making of an AIDS Quilt
Panel: A Burkean Pentadic Analysis
Stephanie J. Poole
Eastern Illinois University

Table of Contents

Abstract/3

Chapter

- I. Introduction/4
 - The NAMES Project Memorial Quilt/6
 - Previous Research/8
 - Research Questions and Methodology/11
 - Dramatism and the Pentad/12
 - Conclusion/15
- II. Background and History/16
 - A Quilting Bee/18
 - The AIDS Quilt/19
 - Conclusion/24
- III. Methods/26
 - Uses of the Pentad/31
 - Conclusion/39
- IV. The Analysis/41
 - The Letters/43
 - The Quilting Group/50
 - Duane Puryear/55
- V. Conclusions/60
 - Theoretical Implications of the Study/66
 - Limitations and Future Research/66
 - Conclusion/68

Abstract

Chapter I briefly discusses the development the AIDS Quilt, demonstrates the importance of the AIDS Quilt as a form of communication, provides an overview of the major academic works on the AIDS Quilt, and describes the methodology to be employed in this study. Chapter II discusses the history of quilting as a form of social culture and the history of the quilt as a form of activism. This study found that the use of the Burkean Pentad also requires a review of the major kinds of studies that historically and currently define the use of this framework within academic circles. Therefore, Chapter III provides an overview of the Burkean Pentadic Analysis literature. Chapter IV presents the analysis and findings. The thesis concludes in Chapter V with a summary of the findings presented here as well as a discussion of the potential implications of the findings. Finally, questions for future research and concerns are addressed.

Chapter I

Introduction

MY NAME IS DUANE KERNS PURYEAR
I WAS BORN ON DECEMBER 20, 1964. I
WAS DIAGNOSED WITH AIDS ON SEPT-
EMBER 7, 1987 AT 4:45 PM. I WAS 22
YEARS OLD. SOMETIMES, IT MAKES ME
VERY SAD. I MADE THIS PANEL MYSELF
IF YOU ARE READING IT, I AM DEAD...

Duane Puryear

In 1991, Duane Puryear became a statistic of the deadly disease known as AIDS. In 1997, the UN agency on AIDS estimated that more than 30 million people are infected worldwide and 16,000 are being infected on a daily basis (Macleans, p. 79). A small percentage of those who have died are memorialized in thread and fabric in what is classically known as a quilt.

The Names Project Memorial Quilt, to which Puryear contributed a panel, began in 1987 when gay activist Cleve Jones made a panel for his friend Marvin Feldman in San Francisco. Since then, the quilt has grown to over 43,000 three foot by six foot, grave size panels. These panels, created by friends, loved ones, and sometimes the victims themselves are adorned with everything from teddy bears and work uniforms to poetry and photographs. The quilt has grown so large that it will never again be seen in its entirety. What began as a refusal of loved ones to see their friends and family be forgotten and shamed has grown into the

largest and most recognizable symbol of AIDS today (The NAMES Foundation, 1998).

The few studies that are available on the AIDS quilt have attempted to comprehend how the quilt functions in society and the meanings behind the panels themselves (Mayo, 1995; Mindel, 1993; Lawrence, 1997; Harris, 1994). While this is thought provoking, it is equally important to understand the motivation behind making a panel itself to understand more fully why this memorial has been so successful in drawing a diverse audience.

The purpose of this study is to examine the making of panels for the AIDS Memorial Quilt by applying Kenneth Burke's Pentadic Analysis. This method is especially useful in understanding what motivates people. The questions explored revolve around why people decide to make panels for the AIDS Quilt. The analysis in this study offers a clearer view of both the discourse and the motivations involved in this process.

The first section of this chapter will briefly discuss the development of the AIDS Quilt. The following section will provide an overview of the major academic works on the AIDS Quilt. Subsequent sections will focus on the research questions and methodology employed in this analysis and the overall organization of the study.

The NAMES Project Memorial Quilt

To the pioneer women of this country, quilts signified many things. Quilts were a home when there was not an available house. Wrapping up in a quilt was a comfort when there were no hospitals or doctors. Finally, wrapping up in a quilt was a shroud when there were no caskets or graveyards. Like the quilts sewn by the female pioneers of this country, the AIDS quilt is both a symbol of life and death to those that view it.

In Women Speak, Foss and Foss (1991) argue that public address is the "most significant form of communication" (p. 16). They believe, however, that this focus on public speaking has excluded many forms of "discursive communication" (p. 160). In their book, Foss and Foss (1991) explored a sampling of texts that characterize what they call discursive communication. Quilting is one of the texts that is offered as an example of this type of communication. It is not just the quilt itself, however, that has rhetorical significance. In many cases, quilting is an act or a process that has rhetorical significance itself beyond that of the quilt. This is especially true with the AIDS Memorial Quilt.

The idea for the AIDS Quilt was conceived in 1985, during a march that was being held in honor of the assassinated gay activists Harvey Milk and George Moscone in

San Francisco. During this event, Cleve Jones asked marchers to write down the names of those who had died from AIDS. These names were then taped to the Federal Building. Jones said,

the names looked like a patchwork quilt, and that idea evoked warm old memories of comfort. I had been consumed with rage and fear. Most of my old friends were dead. I felt that we lived in this little ghetto on the West Coast which would be destroyed without anyone in the rest of the world even noticing. I knew we needed a memorial (Bellm, 35).

With this event as a starting point, the AIDS Memorial Quilt became a testimonial of those who had died from the modern-day plague that is AIDS.

In viewing the quilt, we can not begin to fathom the lives that are represented by these scraps of fabric. While the number of those infected with AIDS and HIV are in the millions, this artifact only represents a small percentage of those who have died from this disease throughout the world. Even though only a percentage of AIDS deaths are recognized in this quilt, however, it is clear that the vastness of this memorial is a significant characteristic of its effect as an expression of grief and rage.

It is estimated that over 1.2 million people visited the Memorial Quilt in the last showing of it in its entirety in October, 1996 (The NAMES Foundation, 1998). The Quilt was

displayed in the National Mall in Washington D.C. It covered an area equal to 24 football fields and over 10,000 volunteers were used to help display this 52 ton memorial (The NAMES Foundation, 1998).

The AIDS Quilt is considered to be the largest example of a community art project in the world (The NAMES Foundation, 1998). The Quilt itself was nominated for a Nobel Peace Prize in 1989 and a documentary on the quilt won an academy award in 1989.

Yet, the NAMES Project and the AIDS Quilt are not without their detractors. Harris (1994) argues that the quilt is cheapened by nostalgia and marketing. He believes that the quilt is "kitsch" and the AIDS epidemic is being sold to the public and romanticized through this type of propaganda (p. 56). Even detractors admit, however, that the quilt is a unique effort to memorialize the dead (Howe, 1997).

Previous Research

Five in-depth studies of the NAMES Project Memorial Quilt have been conducted in recent years. The first study compared the AIDS Quilt to other memorials. The second study looked at both the quilt and the organization known as ACT UP. The third study was an attempt to categorize the panels themselves. The fourth study looked at the AIDS Quilt project as part of a social movement. The fifth study

examined the phenomenon of gay male victims making their own panels. All five studies helped to inform this analysis on what had already been accomplished by researchers in this area.

The first study that is examined is Sturken's (1992) analysis of both the Vietnam war and the AIDS epidemic using memory and identity politics as a framework. While this study is not specifically about the quilt, it does explore memorials such as the AIDS Quilt and the Vietnam War Memorial. Struken found that both of the memorials use the media and disruptive aspects of the memorial itself to create public remembrance, loss, and healing.

In the second study, ACT UP and the NAMES Project were explored by Mindel (1993) using Kenneth Burke's cluster, representative anecdote, and pentadic analyses. During this study, Mindel looked at how the radical tactics employed by ACT UP differed from the "soft tactics" of the AIDS Quilt. Mindel found that agency was the most dominant term employed by both groups. Furthermore, Mindel found that both tactics were necessary to achieve the goals of changing both attitudes and behaviors about AIDS.

In the third study examined, panels of the AIDS Quilt were examined and categorized by Mayo (1995) in her study on the meanings of the panels. Mayo found that all the panels fit into four different categories. She named these categories: "tombstone-like, obituary-like, eulogy-like, and

wake-like" (abstract). Mayo found that the communication mechanisms in the quilt include "direct commentary, message context, creation of intimacy and use of traditional mourning rituals" (abstract).

Krouse (1997) focused upon the idea of social culture and gay activism in the fourth study. Using interviews, observation, and secondary sources, Krouse argued that the quilt is a social expression that overcomes the guilt involved with the AIDS virus. Furthermore, she argues that this is an on-going testimonial that survives the death of the victim.

In the final study considered, Kerewsky (1997) used a variety of psychological foundations to argue that the making of one's own panel offers a way for people with HIV or AIDS to ensure their involvement in the ritual of mourning. Thus, Kerewsky concludes that victims come to terms with their disease, spirituality, and relationships.

While these studies are very interesting, they are just a beginning. The research on the AIDS Quilt can best be described as a on-going process because the quilt is an on-going project that changes every time a new panel is added. Also, none of these studies were concerned with the process of making panels by all the groups involved with the AIDS Memorial Quilt and the motivation behind the process of making panels. This study focuses upon the motivation behind making panels for the AIDS Memorial Quilt. It does not focus

upon the rhetorical messages behind the panels themselves, but upon the creative process behind the panels.

Research Questions and Methodology

As noted in the introduction, the purpose of this study is to examine the motivation behind the making of an AIDS panel. This study would not be complete without examining the different types of people who make panels for the AIDS Quilt. The three different types or groups of people that make panels for the AIDS Quilt are described in this study as loved-ones, strangers, and as a victim of the virus.

This analysis describes the process by which AIDS panels are made and how the quilt became a national and international memorial and issue. More specifically, focus is placed on the question of how AIDS panels get made and what motivations are most significant within this focus.

Using Kenneth Burke's Dramatistic Pentad as a means of analysis, this study names the motives from the most significant ratios in three different pentadic analyses. Naming the motive from the featured ratio is the act of applying ratios to determine the term or element featured by the rhetor (Foss, Foss, & Trapp, 1985).

There are five terms that inform this analysis when using the Burkean Pentad. Burke (1945) explains how the five terms, Act, Agency, Agent, Scene, and Purpose when paired as

ratios, create ten potential relations such as scene-act or agency-purpose. Burke offers that the ratios are more important than the pentad itself, because one term influences the other. Therefore, for this analysis all ratios were recorded before determining what motivations were most significant.

The research questions central to this study are:

1. Which pentadic ratios are most significant in analyzing the process of the making of an AIDS panel?
2. How does the motivation behind the making of an AIDS panel relate to the goals of the AIDS Memorial Quilt?
3. What, if any, is the motivational difference between the different types of panel makers (i.e. strangers, loved-ones, and making one's own panel)?

The methodological approach employed in this study to examine the rhetorical dimensions of the making of an AIDS panel for the NAMES Project Memorial Quilt is a dramatistic approach. Within this framework, this artifact will be looked at as a form of discourse or communication.

Dramatism and the Pentad

Kenneth Burke spent more than seventy years of his life evolving his criticism of literature, rhetoric, and philosophy. Throughout these years, Burke focused on human beings as "symbol-using animals as he questioned the

conventional wisdom of his time" (Brock, 1995, p. 1). The pentad was born out of Burke's attempts to understand human motivation. Burke argued that when a human describes a situation he or she provides a set of answers to five questions: "What was done (act), when or where it was done (scene), who did it (agent), how he did it (agency), and why (purpose)" (Brock, 1995, p. 12). The pentad, then, became not only a tool for content analysis, but also a framework for understanding motivation and conduct (Brock, 1995).

The dramatistic approach allows for one study to build upon another. In this way, theories can be formed. Quite often, one of the methods used to gather information when using pentadic analysis is through the use of literature. Therefore, this study uses a book of letters that were written by those that made panels for the AIDS Quilt. These letters were turned in with panels to the NAMES Foundation and printed in their entirety. For this analysis, one hundred and fifty-nine letters, all the letters in the book that were turned in with a panel, were used. While these letters have rhetorical value themselves, this study used the letters to understand motives in the most conventional sense.

Interviewing is also used as a technique to gather information on the making of a AIDS panel. Interviewing has been used as a tool for many years:

The interview is not generally considered a complete research method by itself. Rather the various forms of question-asking are essential research tools, the picks and shovels with which information is either generated or obtained by the interview (Jones, p. 138).

In this study, a series of three interviews were conducted with women who had completed panels for strangers. These interviews were done in order to understand the process by which these women came to create panels for strangers.

An ethnographic method was also used with the interviews to learn more about the quilting group and why they were doing panels for strangers. To do this, this researcher became what Goodall (1994) calls a "cultural detective".

Over a period of three months, ten hours of recorded data was collected as I became a member of a quilting group that was making panels for the AIDS Quilt. After collecting the data, several exchanges involving the AIDS Quilt and the panels were transcribed. Goodall (1994) suggests that ethnography is the process of representing in words what you have lived through as a person when your stated purpose was to study a culture..."(p. xxiii) Through interviews and taping, a rich collection of data was obtained.

Finally, this study looks at a panel itself. This step is necessary, along with the other two steps, to achieve a comprehensive picture of the making of the AIDS Quilt.

Therefore, this study conducted a third pentadic analysis of an AIDS sufferer who completed his own panel. Since this person has already died from AIDS, this study will analyze his panel to understand the motivations behind making his own memorial.

Conclusion

This chapter found that the development of the AIDS Memorial Quilt was a significant communicative process. The presented overview of the major academic works on the Quilt, however, found a lack of interest in the process of making panels by all groups involved with the quilt and the motivations behind this process. Therefore, this analysis focuses upon the motivations behind making of the AIDS Panels. This was done by applying Kenneth Burke's Pentadic Analysis to three groups of people, loved-ones, strangers, and a victim of the virus. The data was collected using literature, ethnography and interviews, and finally by looking at one the panels created by a victim of the virus.

Chapter II

In the sky the bright stars glittered,
On the banks the pale moon shone,
And 'twas from Aunt Dinah's quilting party
I was seeing Nellie home.

(Stephen Collins Foster, 1856)

Background and History

Almost seventy years ago, Finley (1929) argued that in early days men dominated women. "In needlework only did women hold full sway" (p. 20). In every household, rich or poor, the women sewed. Quilting bees started and became rich with social and political conversation, just as the quilts became rich with political and social messages. Alice Paul created a pieced stars and stripes banner with a new star for each state that ratified womens suffrage during the womens suffrage movement ("One Woman, One Vote", 1995). The suffragettes also raised money through their quilting. This quilting served both as a political statement and as a fundraiser (Atkins, 1994). Even the first American flag and was pieced together stripes and appliquéd stars.

The last ten years has seen a resurgence in the American Folk Art of quilting. This popularity can be seen in fiction, auctions, quilting bees, museums, books, and

even the popular movie "How to make an American Quilt" 1995, starring some of the most influential actors of our time. As the craft brings new interest, so does it achieve respectability with a modern audience.

While one may to appreciate the solid artistry and quality of design that has been achieved over the last hundred years. One must also acknowledge, however, that foremost, quilts are to be used. They provide warmth, comfort, and visual pleasure as well as being artistic investments. They also provide a means of catharsis to the makers. The cathartic use of the quilting itself is well espoused by the quilting community. In times of sickness, loss of a family member, marriage of a child, or money struggles, quilting is an artistic means to lose one's troubles for a while.

Further, quilts are a record of time gone by and of the women who had no other voice except this craft. Cross (1996) writes the history of the Mormon Migration through an analysis of quilts. In her preface, she quotes Wallace Stegner from his publication The Gathering of Zion: The Story of the Mormon Trail (1964),

I shall try to present them in their terms and judge them in mine. That I do not accept the faith that possessed them does not mean I doubt their frequent devotion and heroism in its service. Especially their women. Their women were incredible (vii).

Cross was intrigued by this quotation and sought to understand the role of women during this migration through their quilts. Cross offered an interpretation of these women by studying both letters and quilts.

This study is an attempt to do the same, not looking at the history or the historical record, but at the creation of panels for the AIDS Quilt. The section that follows is a brief introduction to the quilting group of fifteen women that I studied during this process and how the process for making panels for the AIDS quilt began.

A Quilting Bee

"We are just a bunch of quilters" (field notes, 1998). These were the first words I heard as I walked into a stranger's home during a "QuiltWorks" meeting in a small town in Illinois. What I, a stranger, found was friendship enriched with emotion and support. This support was woven into the fabric of these women's relationships and was an integral part of the culture they created.

While this study does not focus on the relationships built by quilters, it does explore communication and women's work. This work is important because, historically, the quilt in America has been entirely a feminine creation. In earlier times, men dominated most areas of women's lives. Only in needlework, such as quilting, did women construct an arena where the feminine voice dominated.

Foss and Foss (1991) suggest that if you ask quilters, "even the most retiring will have a quilt story to share" (p. 25). When quilters do share stories, as the example below illustrates, they contribute not only to the legend of women quilters, but also to the construction of identity and friendship.

Four Female Quilters, discussing a quilt (See Appendix A for transcripts)

1. K: I'm making a panel for the AIDS Quilt which somebody designed. It's good news and bad news. The good news is that you don't have to design it. The bad news is it's Mickey Mouse.
2. all: Laughter

Through their work, the quilters are sharing, not only stories, but the construction of relationships. In the past, such as the suffrage movement, the relationships that these quilters shared were a part of a political and social movement. This is also true with the AIDS Memorial Quilt.

The AIDS Quilt

The mission of the AIDS Quilt is to "help bring an end to the AIDS epidemic" (The Names Project Foundation, 1998). The NAMES Project's goals state that they want to,

provide a means for remembrance and healing; illustrate the enormity of the AIDS epidemic; increase public awareness of AIDS; assist with HIV prevention education and raise funds for community-based AIDS service

organizations (The NAMES Project Foundation, 1998).

As one quilter explained upon first viewing a portion of the quilt who later became a panel maker,

the quilt spoke to me in a language that I understood.

It didn't tell me about t-cells or homophobia,

it told me about families, friends, lovers, and worst of all children. I could feel the pain of their loss in the fabric (Interview A, 1998).

Thus, some of the goals of the NAMES Project are being addressed, if not met, by the quilt.

Upon first examining the AIDS Quilt, most traditional quilters would have to say that this is not a typical example of quilting. As one quilter told me after making an AIDS Quilt for a stranger,

I thought that I needed three pieces of material. If you ask a quilter to make a quilt, you get three pieces of cloth, quilted. I did not know this person, but the woman who asked me to make it for her friend just asked that a teddy bear be quilted on it. I feel really bad because it should have been more personal, but I did not know the person who died (Interview A, 1998).

After viewing sections of the quilt, she said, "I saw everything from teddy bears to a jockey's saddle and some people just painted names and added pictures. This wasn't what I expected" (Interview A, 1998).

If the AIDS Quilt is not at first described as traditional, what is a typical quilt? Robinson (1983), argues that "among other things, it is the history of women, a receptacle of passions, attitudes, largesse, and anger" (p. 26). Applying these standards, what is the AIDS Quilt, but a receptacle of the lives of those that have died and the memories of those who made the panel. Therefore, even though most of the panels do not have a "conventional" quilter's pattern like log cabin, one patch, or flocks of birds, they are traditional in the way they are made according to the above standard except for the idea that quilting focuses upon the history of women. Instead the AIDS Quilt focuses on the history of the person for whom the panel is meant.

One must argue, however, that the AIDS Quilt is also unconventional because when one focuses on women's work and quilting, one can not include the AIDS Quilt because it was not created by a woman. Ironically, it took a homosexual man who was fed up with the treatment of his friends by "straight" society to create the AIDS Quilt.

On the other hand, when making an AIDS panel, one incorporates many of the same traditions and feelings that go into making many other quilts. Quilts, such as mourning quilts, have historically expressed the same passion and anger at the loss of a loved one. Memory quilts have

articles of clothing sewn into the pattern, similar to the AIDS Quilt, to remember those that are gone. According to Atkins (1994), mourning or memory quilts were a step in the healing process, a way of saying good-bye. Further, Atkins notes that some participated in their own memorial quilts before they died. This is also similar to the AIDS Quilt.

Quilting is a passion and, for some, an obsession. Several women in QuiltWorks said that they have numerous quilts hanging in closets that they made because they love to sew. These particular quilts serve no particular purpose except as a catharsis for their makers. To give a quilt away would be similar to giving a photo album away because they serve as a picture of the time in which they were made. In fact, if one attends auctions in many small towns, one might find dozens of quilts that must be auctioned off because the owner has died without giving any away.

This group of women were asked to design panels in some cases. In others they just had to sew them: three total panels for the AIDS Quilt. This was an easy decision for some and a hard decision for others. In the end, only three women out of fifteen worked on the panels for the AIDS Quilt. Although I am sure that the panel makers would have appreciated help, they did not ask for it.

In one conversation, one quilter told another who was working on a panel. "I told you to just tell her no". This other quilter later explained to me that telling someone who

lost a friend or family no would have been unthinkable. The prejudice involving the AIDS Quilt is not a new one. Howe (1997) argues that "symptomatic of the social discomfort that AIDS evokes, the quilting community has for some time debated whether or not to consider the NAMES Project's artifact a quilt at all" (p. 110).

A quilter who belonged to the quilting group found this to be the case. She explained, "Do you notice the chill in the room when I want to talk about my project? I don't understand them. This panel represents someone's son, grandson, brother, friend" (Interview A, 1998). Upon further contemplation, however, the quilters in the group agreed that this quilt was very similar to quilts that they had studied throughout the years. Similar to the African American Story Quilts, many of the panels told the story or history of the lives of those who have died.

The AIDS panels that make up the quilt are also very personal. They speak not only of those who have died, but of those who have made them. In a letter from a family that made a panel, they said,

This panel has been prepared for our father, Richard Gordon Simmons. The NAMES Project has given us the chance to express feelings, emotions, and experience which most people do not have the opportunity to share with others, especially after a loved one has physically left us...It has taken one and a half

years to get up the guts and perseverance to finish this panel. Please enjoy the bits and pieces of our father's life contained within this panel. It is only a tiny part of his existence, a glimpse a reflection of his life (in Brown, 77).

For the family of this victim, the making of a panel was very cathartic.

Of course, this is not the only agenda that the AIDS Memorial Quilt offers. The quilt began and has been a message within the gay community to officials who neglected to do anything about the disease until it became an epidemic in "straight" society. Many of the panel's messages discuss the connection between AIDS and the victims homosexuality.

Interestingly, several panels that were completed for people who did not receive HIV through sexual conduct explicitly spell that out. For example, one panel stated, "A Hemophiliac..." and then proceeded to explain how they received the virus that causes AIDS. So even in death, families and friends feel the need to distance themselves from the "homosexual link" to the HIV virus. This also leads to some ambiguity within in the messages of the panels themselves.

Conclusion

Clearly, quilting is a significant form of both social and political communication. At the beginning of this chapter, I talked about women's work and quilting. The rest

of the chapter was devoted to the AIDS Quilt and how it is both conventional, a symbol of the person who made it and who it was created for, and unconventional because it was not created by a woman. As the quilts of our foremothers sought to tell stories, the panels in the AIDS Quilt send very obvious political and personal messages. Like the political heirlooms of the past, such as the first flag of the United States, the AIDS Quilt is a powerful social heirloom of our time.

Chapter III

Methods

This chapter traces the evolution of the dramatistic pentad in Burke's work by discussing Burke's philosophy of rhetoric. Kenneth Burke (1937) argues that language is strategic and that "these strategies size up the situations, name their structure and outstanding ingredients, and name them in a way that contains an attitude toward them" (p. 1). He also believes that these strategies have universal relevance. These views are reflected in all his works: Counter-Statement, 1931; Permanence and Change, 1935; Attitudes Toward History, 1937; The Philosophy of Literary Form, 1941; A Grammar of Motives, 1945; A Rhetoric of Motives, 1950; Rhetoric of Religion, 1961; and Language as Symbolic Action, 1966 (Scott & Brock, 1972).

Burke's dramatistic approach to rhetoric supplies a structure that transforms, or one might argue that it dissects, the language. Through the dramatistic pentad, Burke found a way to inquire into the motives behind the rhetoric. The pentad was created during the period of Burke's life that has been described as his "critic of language" period (Brock, 1995, p. 11). During this period, Burke introduced the pentad in A Grammar of Motives, 1945:

We shall use five terms as generating principle of our investigation. They are Act, Scene, Agent, Agency, and Purpose. In a rounded statement about motives, you must

have some word that names the act (names what took place, in thought or deed), and another that names the scene (the background of the act, the situation in which it occurred); also, you must indicate what person or kind of person (agent) performed the act, what means or instruments he used (agency), and the purpose (p. xv).

This becomes more complex when Burke (1945) explains how the five terms, paired as ratios, create ten potential relations such as scene-act or agency-purpose. He explains that the ratios are more important than the pentad itself, because one term influences the other. After one applies the ratios, one must name the motive from the featured ratio.

The pentad was not a sudden revelation to Burke. On the contrary, according to Brock (1995), the pentad had evolved from his earlier work Permanence and Change and The Philosophy of Literary Form. For instance, in Philosophy of Literary Form (1941), Burke offers,

We propose to take ritual as the Ur-form, the hub, with all other aspects of human action treated as spokes radiating from this hub. That is, the social sphere is considered in terms of situations and acts, in contrast with the physical sphere, which is considered in mechanistic terms, idealized as a flat cause-and-effect relationship (p. 103).

This shows that the pentad was evolving in the work of Burke before it was introduced in A Grammar of Motives and that this model became more involved over time.

Burke's evolution continued. In Dramatism (1968), Burke argued that the "act" was the center of the pentad and that a sixth term, that he labeled "attitude", should be added. The "act" is the center from which all other terms radiate like the "spokes" that were mentioned in the earlier passage from Philosophy of Literary Form. Brock (1995) argues that

with these modifications it is clear that the pentad has become an internal, unified system for understanding symbol-using that unites internal and external realities as 'attitudes' with the 'act' or action as the way humans relate to the external, nonsymbolic world (p. 23).

However, few academics use the sixth term "attitude" in their pentadic analysis. Most instead include "attitude" within the idea of "agent" (Mills, 1998) or so not directly define the sixth term at all (Carlson, 1989; Cooks & Descutner, 1993; Hickling, 1993; Birdsell, 1987). This seems to stem from the opinion that "attitude" is already addressed, within other parts of the model (Brock, 1985). Conrad (1995) argues that,

Burke oscillated between an affirmation of a voluntarist view of human action, with its related aesthetic theory of symbolic action and multiple attempts to integrate action and motion within a symbolicity-centered model of practical criticism (p. 10).

While Conrad was looking at what he found to be a problem of agency within the pentad, one may also apply this argument to attitude.

If we are looking at how to integrate action and motion within a "symbolicity-centered model" then one has to look at attitude. However, it does not have to be a separate part of the pentad. Instead, incorporating it within the element of agent is both thought provoking and economical plus attitudes do not exist independent of agents.

Finally, in looking at dramatism and the pentad, one must address Burke's ideas on guilt and redemption for these two terms are contained within the idea of the metaphor dramatism (Brock, 1985). One may see this in The Rhetoric of Religion (1961), in which Burke introduces his concept of order:

Here are the steps

In the Iron Law of History

That welds Order and Sacrifice:

Order leads to Guilt

(for who can keep commandments!)

Guilt leads to Redemption
(for who would not be cleansed!)

Redemption needs Redeemer
(which is to say, a victim!)

Order
Through Guilt
To Victimage
(hence: Cult of the Kill).... (p. 4-5).

Therefore, to Burke "order" leads to "guilt", through "victimage", one may receive "redemption" (Collins & Clark, 19). Moreover, this cycle, "which is primarily a religious metaphor, unifies over Burke's terms for order , creating a never-ending rhetorical process" (Brock, 1985, p.99).

Thus, when examining the pentad, one may argue that it is similar to this poem on order, in that the pentad is a metaphor. In fact, Brock (1995) argues that "Burke's models or methods-definition of man, identification, pentad, and terms for order-are his major concepts, and when Burke presents these concepts in his second stage, metaphor is central to each one" (p. 23). However, Burke argued that the pentad is not a metaphor but a "fixed form" that explores symbolic activity (Brock, 1995; McPhail, 1995; Blair, 1995).

The idea of dramatism as a symbolic action and "fixed form" is not one that came to Burke immediately (McPhail, p. 90). However, in Dramatism, Burke rejects the idea that dramatism and the pentad are merely metaphorical (p.23). From this point on, "drama is employed, not as a metaphor but as a fixed form that helps us discover what the implications of the terms 'act' and 'person' really mean" (p. 24).

Through the writings of Burke and the analysis of Burke by academics, one must conclude that the pentad offers several opportunities for rhetorical criticism. First, the pentad proves that language can manipulate and cause action. Second, that this action causes a "motion" or reaction in people (Conrad, 1995). Finally, once we are able to discern how someone describes a situation, we are able to discover his or her motive for the action.

Uses of the Pentad

Foss, Foss, and Trapp (1985) acknowledge that "Burke intended the pentad to be used internally-within a rhetorical transaction such as a speech" (p. 168). However, it has been expanded to include almost anything within the rhetorical arena (Benoit, 1994).

Many have offered that this expansion has diluted Burke's work. However, Swartz (1995) argues that "by recognizing the rhetorical qualities of artistic expression" Burke makes it "easier for rhetorical theorists to engage in

cultural analysis" (p. 312). While Brock (1992) argues that there is a possibility that Burke's theory has become too general (p. 347), others argue that this system's flexibility is one of its virtues.

To examine the flexibility of Burke's Dramatistic Pentad, within the field of communication, this paper ventures through the years from 1970 to 1998, examining in detail, seven different pentadic analyses to feature both the flexibility and breadth of the pentad as a model for discovering both content and motivation.

First, let's examine a pentadic analysis of a speech. In 1970, Ling examined Senator Edward Kennedy's address to the people of Massachusetts for the "purpose of describing events surrounding the death of Miss Mary Jo Kopechne" or what is better known as Chappaquiddick (p. 81). Ling identified the five pentadic elements as related to Kennedy's statement about the events that occurred when Kopechne died:

The scene (the events surrounding the death of Miss Kopechne)

The agent (Kennedy)

The act (Kennedy's failure to report immediately after the accident)

The agency (whatever methods were available to make a report)

The purpose (To fulfill his legal and moral responsibilities) (p. 83).

Ling (1970), notes that in the way in which Kennedy describes the situation, the scene controls the situation (p. 83). Ling also argues that Kennedy, through his denial of drinking and a relationship with Kopechne, offers an agent that is moral and rational prior to the accident and a victim during the accident (p. 84).

In the second pentad that Ling (1970) completed Kennedy led the audience to believe that "his future depended, not on his own decision, but on whether or not the people of Massachusetts accepted the whispers and innuendo that constituted the scene" (p. 85). Through Ling's two pentadic analyses, he illustrates that the Kennedy was trying to shift the guilt from himself to the people of Massachusetts and secure his future.

At the time when Ling wrote this article in 1970, he knew that the speech had temporarily secured Kennedy's senate seat. What Ling did not know was that this speech helped conserve Kennedy's long-term future as a politician as well. This pentadic analysis illustrates that language does have the ability to manipulate and that this manipulation creates action.

The second pentadic analysis that this paper will explore is Fisher's (1974) breakthrough Burkean Analysis of a multiple murder suicide (p. 175). In this article, the

sixth element, attitude, is used to analyze this event. Fisher argues that although attitude is "rarely acknowledged" it was critical to understanding the Blank-White case (p. 189). This article was also a breakthrough because it did not analyze a speech.

Fisher discusses the elements of the pentad in relation to this tragic event:

The Agent in the case is, of course, Joseph William (Blank) White; the Act is the implicit and explicit message of the killings as well as the message in the note of intent; the Agencies are the rifle and the note; the Scene is Building 12; the Attitude is that of White; the Agents (audience) are the victims, White's CO-workers, the survivors of those killed, and the community at large; and, the Purpose is that which the following analysis yields (p. 182-183).

Fisher (1974) found, through this analysis, that the Act-Agency ratio is the "most significant" in this analysis (p. 189). That in "committing the Act, White carried out total victimage (homicide) and total mortification (suicide) and in combining the two, White performed the most extreme form of reidentification possible to man" (p. 187).

In this study, Fisher (1974) was able to show how this event was foreshadowed in the events that had occurred in White's life up to the shooting. This study also showed that

pentadic analysis is useful in studying things other than speeches.

In the third study examined, Kelley (1987) analyzes the choices made by former U.S. Congressman George Hansen of Idaho as he faced a felony conviction and a reelection bid (p. 204). In this study, Kelley offers two pentads. The first pentad, analyzes events surrounding Hansen's crime:

Scene: Washington, DC

Agent: George Hansen

Act: Illegal campaign activities resulting in conviction

Agency: Deception; dishonest communication

Purpose: Personal profit (p. 206).

In the second pentad, Kelley offers a analysis of Hansen's conviction:

Scene: Events surrounding the conviction

Agent: Federal government

Act: Conviction

Agency: Persecution and abuse

Purpose: To rid the federal government of Hansen (p. 207).

Kelley argues that these two pentads show that Hansen's rhetoric was "designed to eliminate any personal responsibility for his conviction" (p. 204). In fact, Hansen ended up being beaten by only 133 votes. So while, Hansen did not win his reelection bid, his rhetoric did eliminate

his responsibility for the crime in the minds of many voters.

In the fourth study that this paper explores, Carlson (1989) examines how Russell H. Conwell was able to win over audiences with a speech that was canned by academics and critics. Carlson argues that Conwell used "mini-dramas" and that this method made his speech very compelling to the audience (p. 353).

Carlson (1989) also notes that Conwell used narrative as a "transforming agent" and that this agent manipulated the audience's ideas of wealth and guilt (p. 354). Thus, Carlson argues that once an audience accepts a story, a skilled speaker may manipulate it in "almost any manner without shattering the fragile identification between audience and story" (p. 354).

Through Carlson's (1989) study, one may realize the power that narrative may have on the audience. Furthermore, one may acknowledge, through this pentad and Burkean analysis of speech, that a mastering of the pentadic ratios can equal commercial success.

Cooks and Descutner (1993) examine two eating disorder therapies, using dramatisic analysis, in the fifth example that this paper addresses. It is interesting that, once again, the analysis went outside the realm of a speech. In the first pentad, Cooks and Descutner analyze the discourse of "Spiritual Recovery":

The act (abstinence)

The agent (Higher Power)

The agency (faith)

The scene (material existence)

The purpose (spiritual fulfillment) (p. 501).

It is obvious, because of the way that this type of recovery is ordered, that the agent is the dominant term (p. 502).

In the second pentadic analysis, Cooks and Descutner (1993) examine the discourse of feminist theory, recovery:

The act (search for identity)

The agent (women)

The agency (rediscovering feminine power)

The scene (patriarchal society)

The purpose (uniting mind and body, saving the female soul) P. 509.

Cooks and Descutner (1993) concluded, through Burkean analysis, that "each therapy's discourse works rhetorically in different ways to produce contrasting accounts of the place of women in society, the source and meaning of eating disorders, and the means of coping with these disorders" (p. 512). Thus, while some of the elements might be similar, they serve different functions and produce different reactions.

In the sixth study, Griffin (1995) uses Burkean analysis to teach rhetorical criticism with *Thelma and Louise*. Once again, the study did not focus on a speech.

Casting the movie as the Rhetor, Griffin utilizes five different pentads within this essay. The first pentad is the "murder of Harlan" (p. 166). In this pentad,

(a) the scene is Harlan's attempted rape in the parking lot of the Silver Bullet and his obscene response to Louise's 'When a woman's cryin' she isn't havin' any fun'; (b) the act is the shooting of Harlan; (c) the agent is Louise; (d) the agency is the gun; and (e) the purpose is to put a stop to his unacceptable, hateful, and rude behavior (p. 166).

With this pentad, students are able to discuss, not only the pentad itself, but philosophical systems (i.e. mysticism) and feminism.

The four other pentads are titled: "The Robbery of the Convenience store"; "Locking the Police Officer in the trunk of the Patrol Car"; "Blowing up the Gasoline truck"; and "The Choice of Death" (p. 166-168). Griffin (1995) argues that although some students may disagree with the film's messages, using Burkean analysis develops a range of critical thinking skills.

The final pentadic analysis that this paper addresses is Mills' (1998) study of an "ESL Scandal" (p.1). The scandal was an event that happened on a college campus which involved foreign students and intercultural confusion. In this scandal, the students were charged more than regular students and were threatened. The pentad is as follows:

The act (What allegedly took place in the ESL program)
The agent (Rita and her attitude are described as mean)
The agency (Rita's means of performing the act included verbal threats, intimidation, and later, a damning silence.)

The scene (a small program overseen by the agent's husband)

The purpose (the situation is framed as an attempt to mistreat students who are perceived as unlikely to complain because of their intercultural beliefs) (p. 5)

The reason why this study was included in this paper is two-fold. First, it is the most recent pentad that was located while completing the research. Secondly, and the most interesting, is that Mills framed "attitude" as an aspect of the "agent".

Through this study, Mills (1998) showed that "attitude" can be addressed within the element of "agent". Also, this is one more example of a pentadic analysis that did not evolve around a speech.

Conclusions

Although the studies that have been presented in this literature review are far from exhaustive, they do provide valuable insight for a study of pentadic analysis. It would appear that the majority of the studies utilizing pentadic analysis share at least one common characteristic. They did not include all of the ratios that could have been studied.

While time and space are constraints in academics, it would have been very interesting to see how all the ratios compared to one another.

Overall, it can be argued that literature on pentadic analysis and Burke have served as a stimulus for discussion and debate within academic circles. The freedom of choice that this method allows is purposeful. Burke felt that choices are made for a purpose and that symbolic activity is related to everything that we do. For this reason, dramatism, specifically the pentad was chosen for this study.

Since the central issue in this paper is to understand what motivates people to make panels for the AIDS Quilt, the pentad was both appropriate and thought provoking. Three pentads, loved-ones, strangers, and a victim of the virus, were necessary, however, in order to come to a better understanding of the motivations behind this process.

Chapter IV
The Analysis

The Quilt enclosed was made in memory of James Nathan Scott, Jimmy to those of us who knew and loved him.

Tom Barrett

Shortly after Robb was ordained, he came to talk to me about difficulties he was having with being gay.

John P. Hilgman

This panel I made is a lasting memorial of my mother, who contracted AIDS through a blood transfusion.

A loving daughter from New England
I made this quilt piece for C.J. The quilt does not bear his name because his family does not want anyone to know that their son died of AIDS.

Kay

13 months and 8 days as recorded in Earth time, you were with us. But you will live in our memories forever. You were not born, nor did you pass, in vain.

Till we meet again, your family

These first few lines of several letters, written by those who have made panels for the AIDS Quilt, demonstrate the diversity of the lives that are affected by this artifact. Mothers and fathers, brothers and sisters,

grandparents, babies, and even clergy are represented in this Quilt.

The value of examining an artifact that transcends the boundaries of what is traditionally thought of as rhetoric and/or communication has been established by looking at previous studies such as Fisher's (1974) analysis of a "Multiple Murder and Suicide". The pentad was selected as a method of rhetorical analysis because Burke conceived of the pentad as a means to understand human motivation. Since the issue in this paper is understanding why people make panels for the AIDS Quilt and how this quilt became the most recognizable symbol of AIDS, an examination of motives is appropriate.

Burke (1954) argues that "human conduct being in the realm of action ... is most directly discussible in dramatistic terms" (p. 274). Moreover, Burke offers that events can be understood, in a broad sense, like the elements of a play.

For the purposes of this study, using the pentad involves: 1) Identifying Act, Agent, (including Attitude), Agency, Scene, and Purpose in three different pentadic analyses; 2) applying all the ratios in order to determine the dominant ratio; and 3) describing motive from the dominant ratio. For this study, it was decided to include Attitude within the pentadic term, Agent.

There is no strict criteria for choosing the featured or dominant ratio. Rather, it is subjective. The dominant ratio is only discernible after applying all of the ratios in the pentad. The assumption is that with freedom of choice among the alternatives, comes a purposive decision. Moreover, this decision includes the assumption that people present messages according to their perceptions of the drama that is a part of their very existence (Foss, 1989).

Three different pentadic analyses informed this study. The first pentad used one hundred and fifty-nine letters written by those who have contributed panels to the AIDS Quilt. The second pentad revolved around a series of interviews and discussions with a quilting group that was making panels for people they did not know on the request of friends and family. The final pentad was conducted after studying a panel and an interview that was conducted several years ago by a man who completed his own panel before he died.

The Letters

The letters that were analyzed came from a book titled, "The Names Project Book of Letters". The editor, Brown, 1992, was so moved by the Quilt during a showing of it in Washington, that he wanted to do something to help. His compilation of letters in their entirety is at once moving and thought provoking.

For this study, one hundred and fifty-nine letters were analyzed in order to understand motives in their most conventional sense. Several letters were not used because they were not about making panels. These letters were written by family and friends of those who had died from the AIDS virus.

The Analysis

The Act in this case is of course, the making of an AIDS Quilt Panel; the Agent is the maker of the panel whose Attitude could be described as heartbroken, sad, angry and/or thoughtful; the Agency is needle, thread, and mementos of a person's life; the Scene is the Agent's hands; and the Purpose is to provide closure after a death of a person close to the Agent.

Ratios

In order to better inform this study, all of the ratios were completed and recorded in this paper. Unfortunately, most published studies (see Fisher, 1974; Ling, 1970; and Kelley, 1987) are not able to do this because of space constraints. However, only by completing and analyzing all the ratios does a researcher fully understand what ratio is featured.

Act-Scene

The scene is in the hands of the person(s) who makes the quilt or the act. This is important to note because this is one of the only memorials that is handmade. The person

who is close to the one who died is usually the one who completes this task. For example, Mary Carter writes for her son, "Please take the bits and pieces that make up the fabric of my life and use them for your purpose" (Brown, 1992, p. 2). The Act is also considered to be a message. This message is about the person who died, about the people who made this message, and the idea that the person will be remembered.

Act-Agent

Again, in most cases, it is a loved one (Agent) who completes the Act according to the letters. It is appropriate to record this because most memorials, such as headstones or statues, are not physically made by the loved one. It is a personal investment to make this memorial unlike the others.

Act-Agency

In committing the Act, with needle, thread, paint, pictures, and mementos, it reidentifies the person who is represented by the quilt. They are now identified as a victim of AIDS. This is important to note because Burke believes that "identification is inseparable from rhetoric" (Fisher, 1974, p. 187).

It is very significant that the message is a quilt. AIDS has always been considered a social disease. Much time and effort have gone into explaining how everyone is affected by this virus. A quilt as a memorial is not a

sterile picture. It identifies the victim as a human being not just a statistic.

Act-Purpose

The making of the panel seems to have a cathartic effect for the person(s) who made the panel. Time and time again, the letters asked how do I go about representing a life on a three by six foot piece of cloth? The Purpose of the Act in this case seems to be three-fold. The first Purpose is to commemorate the life of the person who died. The second Purpose is to mourn the death. The third Purpose is to ask why this happened in the first place.

It is thought provoking that numerous letters mentioned God. Many people who have AIDS or who have died from the disease were shunned by their churches. AIDS was (and is) considered a social disease. Several religious leaders suggested that this disease was a way of cleaning up society. Therefore, it is interesting to note that many letters asked God to take care of the person who died. Several also asked God to end this disease, so that others did not have to suffer.

Scene-Agent

It is appropriate to acknowledge that the Scene is a part of the Agent. Sue Caves understands the significance of this as she writes about her son's quilt (sic):

How does a Mother go about creating a memorial to her son by representing his life on a 3' by 6' piece of cloth?

This was the question I asked myself over and over again, after I decided to honor my son Mike by creating a panel in his memory for the NAMES Project Quilt.

As I began to design Mike's panel and lay out the pieces, I felt as though it was the saddest and most beautiful experience of my life-somehow merging the pain of burying my son in October of 1986 with the joy giving birth to him 37 years ago.

Then, when I took the pieces to my daughter-n-law's house to sew them together I knew that this experience-creating the panel-truly became an all-family project.

And I knew it was a joint family effort that would have pleased Mike very much...

...all across America there are other mothers like me, as well as fathers, grandparents, sisters, brothers, sons, daughters, lovers and friends, who have found themselves-or soon will-drawn to the Quilt by the immense power of its hope and humanity...

I did it for two reasons-for Mike and for all the others who've been lost to AIDS, and for myself and all the others who have lost them. (Brown, 1992, p. 4)

This mother understands the significance of making this Panel for her son. It became a family project, a way of saying good-bye.

Scene-Agency

The agency is what instruments were used to create the panel. The instruments used in making the AIDS Panels are needle, thread, paintbrushes, and glue. This is an active process of creation. The scene is the hands of the person who created it. This could be a mother, father, daughter, son, friend, lover, stranger, and/or the victim themselves.

Scene-Purpose

Burke believes that the scene contains the circumstances that influence the actions and agents. The significance is, again, the fact that it was made by hand. The Purpose of making it by hand is to remember the person and feel that they are doing something about this disease.

Agent-Agency

The needle and thread (Agency) is used by the creator or Agent. This is consistent with every panel studied. Burke believes that humans are symbol using. In creating a panel, the agent is using symbols to commemorate the life of the victim and to make sure that they are not forgotten.

Agent-Purpose

The Agent is the person who is making the panel. The Agent's purpose is to commemorate the life of the person who

died and try to find a place to mourn with others who have had friends and family who have died from this disease.

It is hard to commiserate with someone who has had a family member become a victim of violent crime without having had that experience yourself. AIDS is similar to this reaction because it is hard to understand the toll that this disease has on the loved-ones.

When one has made their own panel, they are also looking for a forum to mourn their life. Making one's own panel seems an acceptable method of transcending death and living on in this fabric. In this way, the maker would not be forgotten, even though he or she died.

Agency-Purpose

Again, the creation of the panel is very important. The Purpose of this fabric, paint, pictures, toys, clothing is to humanize this disease. For example, one letter explained that upon first viewing the AIDS Quilt,

The panel spelled out a victim's name on a simulated Scrabble board, complete with word and letter-score squares and numeric point values for the letters of the person's name. I am a Scrabble player, and felt sad that this unknown (to me) person who died at probably a young age and probably with much pain and suffering, would never be able to play Scrabble with me-or do anything-with anyone, again. (Brown, 1992, p. 174)

The elements that go into making the quilt humanize the lives of those who have died from this disease.

Featured Ratio

It would appear that the featured ratio for this pentadic analysis seems to be Act-Purpose. Almost every letter explained why the panel was created. All of the makers of the panels wanted to commemorate the person's life so that they are never forgotten. Through these descriptions, it is obvious that this is the featured ratio. The Act-Scene ratio, however, is also relevant to this pentad. This memorial is handmade, in most cases by loved-ones of the victim. The message is very important to the motivation behind these panels. The person shall never be forgotten.

The Quilting Group

This pentad was an analysis of a group of three out of fifteen female quilters who were in the process of making three panels for strangers. This group, who ranged in age from ten to seventy, got together twice a month to quilt. It should be noted that not all fifteen quilters were at every meeting nor did all of them work on this project. However, they were all involved with discussions about this project. Ten hours of taped data was obtained at these meetings. Out of ten hours, four conversations were transcribed. Also, three interviews of the main women involved in this project were completed.

The Analysis

The Act in this case is the making of an AIDS Quilt Panel; the Agent is the quilting group whose attitude could be described as feeling needed and/or resentful; the Agency is needle and thread; the Scene is the Agent's hands; and the Purpose is to fulfill a request for help.

Ratios

Once again, all the ratios were completed in order to gain insight into the motivation behind the making of these panels. The panels were made by a different collection of people, strangers, so it is necessary to complete all the ratios in order to fully understand what ratio is featured.

Act-Scene

Like the last pentad, the scene is the hands of the persons who makes the quilt or the Act. In this case, the hands were not the hands that had touched this person in life. Instead, they were the hands of a stranger. The Act message is still one of remembrance because the hands were not as important as the message in this case.

Act-Agent

With these panels, a loved one did not complete this Act. Like a headstone, the Act was created upon the request of someone else. This allows for a distance between the artifact and the Agent. The request for panels to be made was issued only a couple of weeks before the AIDS Quilt was coming to the area in which this group is located. Thus, on

one hand the group felt resentful that they were asked to create these panels.

On the other hand, they knew that this meant a lot to the people who had asked. One woman, in particular, who ended up doing most of the work, felt that this was a beautiful project. However, she did feel weird because she did not know the person for whom she was making the quilt. She felt that the quilt would have been better made by the person who knew the victim.

Burke (1961) argues that, "order leads to guilt" and guilt leads to redemption" (p. 4-5). Applying this concept to this project is very interesting. These women did not really want to do this project for many reasons: (1) they did not know the person(s) asking; (2) they did not know the person(s) who had died; and (3) they were given short notice.

The quilters felt resentful that they were asked to complete this project. Then they felt guilty that they were resentful. Finally, through completing this project, they felt good that they had helped someone else and this project (redemption).

Act-Agency

In committing the Act, with needle and thread, the maker is doing something that they do quite often, make quilts. For this group, quilting is very personal, but it is

also habit. They quilt on a daily basis. Thus, once again, they are able to distance themselves from the artifact.

Act-Purpose

The making of an AIDS Quilt Panel can have a cathartic effect for the person(s) who made the panel. However, in this case the cathartic effect was that the person(s) felt helpful.

The purpose of making this Panel was to fulfill a request. This group would not have been involved with the AIDS Project Memorial Quilt if they had not been asked. Therefore, they did not choose to do this on their own.

Scene-Agent

The hands of the quilting group (Scene) made the Agent. However, this is not unusual. Hands make headstones, the Vietnam War Memorial. The AIDS Quilt seems to lose some of its effect when it is created by strangers. This is because this is a different kind of memorial, created primarily by the hands that know the person who died.

Scene-Agency

The Scene is the hands of the quilting group. The Agency is needle and thread. However, these experts had no idea how to create a memorial to someone's life that they did not know. Thus, while their panels were quite beautiful, they were also not as personal as many of the other panels.

Scene-Purpose

The Purpose was to fulfill a request. The reason why the quilting group was asked was because they knew how to quilt. The artifact is called a quilt, so who better to do it than a quilting group.

Agent-Agency

The Agency is needle and thread. This is consistent with every panel. The Agent, in this case is the quilting group. They are experts with needle and thread, but they are not experts in knowing the person who died and expressing their life on fabric.

Agent-Purpose

The quilting groups purpose was to fulfill a request. Again, this is not as personal to the group as it is to the people who make them for family and friends. It is also not nearly as personal as someone who made it for themselves.

Agent-Purpose

The Agent-Purpose ratio is interesting because the Agent's purpose was to fulfill a request and in the long-run get the task done so that they could move on to other projects. Again, this makes it less personal.

Agency-Purpose

The Panels that were made by the quilting group were interesting but did not tell a story of the person's life. Instead, they were needle and thread creations, beautiful,

but one could hang one of them of the wall and not understand that the panel is a memorial.

Featured Ratio

The featured ratio in this pentadic analysis would appear to be Act-Agent. The panel, or any panel, would not have been created by this group if there had not been a request. If the group had not felt like they had to do it (order, resentment, guilt, redemption), the panel would not have been made. It is significant that the attitude was described as helpful and resentful. This shows that the making of a panel for this group did not have personal meaning, it was just a favor.

Duane Puryear

Duane Puryear was a man who created his own panel. His goal was to be "the longest living person with AIDS" (The NAMES Project, 1998). So why did he create this panel? What was his motivation? Through analyzing his panel and a narrative about Puryear, this pentad attempts to better understand the previous questions.

The Analysis

The Act, in the case of Duane Puryear, is the making an AIDS Panel; the Agent is Duane Puryear whose attitude was described as active, independent, honest, and sad; the Agency is needle and thread; the Scene is Duane's hands; and the Purpose is to educate people about AIDS while humanizing or personalizing the virus. The Purpose is also to do

something, anything about getting this virus because the person is helpless to save themselves unless science finds a cure.

Act-Scene

In this pentad, hands that make the Act are significant. This is a person commemorating their life before they die. To make your own death memorial is very unusual and in researching, I found no other instances that this has occurred. Therefore, if this has happened before, it is very rare.

Act-Agent

Duane Puryear made the panel himself because he felt he needed to educate others about the disease. He contracted AIDS when he was sixteen. His attitude was honest, he wanted to let other people understand that this disease could happen to anyone, young or old. He described himself as sad on his panel. He wanted to survive. He wanted a cure to be found. Wouldn't anyone want this if they had a terminal illness diagnosed at the age of twenty-two?

Act-Agency

The Agency is needle and thread in the case of Duane Puryear's panel. In committing this Act, with needle and thread, Puryear reidentified himself as not only someone with AIDS, but as someone who would die from AIDS. This is a contrast from a tattoo that he had inscribed on his chest that read, "Some will survive" (The Names Project, 1998).

These two actions were something that Puryear could accomplish as an activist. He felt that the Memorial Quilt was a positive project. He also wanted to survive. However, in completing the quilt he had reidentified himself, which was against everything else that he preached. Maybe, this is why he lost the panel and it had to be recreated from photographs after he died, so that it could join the quilt.

Act-Purpose

The making of the panel seemed to have the effect of saying, I am doing something about this disease. When diagnosed with a terminal illness, such as AIDS, one has to feel helpless. The making of one's own panel was a way of doing something about it.

Scene-Agent

The importance of this ratio is that the person for whom this panel is made is the person who creates it. In a sense, Puryear made his own headstone.

Scene-Agency

With needle and thread, Agency, the hands (Scene) of the person who is dying creates their own memorial. Again, this is not something that is typical. With this virus, one is enabled to create their own memorial. In no other public memorials, is the artifact itself created by the one who has died, before they died, knowing they would die.

Scene-Purpose

The creation of the quilt is very significant. The purpose is to educate, and to do something that makes the person feel that they are not helpless. To do this, the Scene is the Puryear's own hands. This made him feel like he was accomplishing something against this disease. Later, when he found other outlets, such as lecturing, he no longer needed the quilt panel.

Agent-Agency

The Agency is a tool or symbol used by the Agent such as needle and thread. This is consistent with every panel. The symbols that Puryear used were stark black and white block letters sewn in place.

Agent-Purpose

The Agent is the person who makes the panel. In this case, it is also the person for whom the panel commemorates. Puryear's purpose was to tell everyone how he felt about having the disease. For example, he writes on his panel, "Sometimes, it makes me very sad" (The NAMES Project, 1998). His other purpose was to feel that he was doing something about having this disease and not just sitting around waiting to die.

Agency-Purpose

The Agency is needle and thread and the Purpose was to educate and do something about contracting this virus. Puryear also wanted to put a face onto this virus and the

quilt. He told who he was and how he felt about dying. He stated, "If You are Reading this I am Dead".

Featured Ratio

The featured ratio in this pentad would appear to be Act-Agency. In creating this Act, with needle and thread, Puryear completed the most significant reidentification possible. He identified himself as dead. Duane Puryear was sixteen when he contracted HIV. He was twenty-two when he was diagnosed with AIDS. In 1991, at the age of twenty-six, he died. He had lived with HIV for ten years.

During the time that Puryear knew he had AIDS, he became an activist. First, he worked on an AIDS hotline. Later, he became a lecturer. In Dallas, he founded the speakers bureau, which is still an important part of the Dallas AIDS Resource Center (The NAMES Project, 1998).

The featured ratio shows that Puryear was on his way to being an activist when he made his own panel. This was his first act, with his own hands, that reidentified himself as a victim of this virus. Puryear was trying to do something, anything to combat this fatal virus. Even if this process meant that he soon would die.

Chapter V

Conclusions

The past is hidden...
beyond the reach of the intellect
in some material object.

Marcel Proust

The purpose of this study was to examine motivations behind the making of panels for the AIDS quilt. In order to better understand the motivations behind these artifacts, Kenneth Burke's Pentadic Analysis was used. In addition, three different pentadic analyses were completed in order to better inform this study.

Summary of Findings

As noted in Chapter one, three research questions are considered central to this analysis:

1. Which pentadic ratios are most significant in analyzing the making of an AIDS panel?
2. How does the motivation behind the making of an AIDS panel relate to the goals of the AIDS Memorial Quilt?
3. What, if any, is the motivational difference between the different types of panel makers. (i.e. strangers, loved-ones, and making one's own panel)

Since no one individual chapter was solely devoted to a particular question, it is necessary to summarize the findings of this study. Also, an attempt will be made to provide additional insights into these questions that have not been addressed thus far.

The first research question focuses directly on the motivations behind the making of the panels. Three different pentadic analyses informed this study. This was necessary because three different types of people, loved ones, quilters, and the victim, make the panels. Act-Purpose (the letters), Act-Agent (the quilters), and Act-Agency (Duane Puryear), respectively, were the three ratios found to be the most significant in the making of the AIDS Panels.

The second research question focuses on how the motivation behind the AIDS Quilt relates to the goals of the AIDS Memorial Quilt itself. The mission of the AIDS Quilt is to "help bring an end to the AIDS epidemic" (The NAMES Project Foundation, 1998). The NAMES Project's goals state that they want to,

provide a means for remembrance and healing; illustrate the enormity of the AIDS epidemic; increase public awareness of AIDS; assist with HIV prevention education and raise funds for community-based AIDS service organizations (The NAMES Project Foundation, 1998).

The motivation behind the first pentad, the letters, spoke about remembrance and healing. The second pentad

showed that there was little relation to the goals of the Memorial Quilt and the motivation behind the making of a panel. The quilters were not personally involved.

The strongest relation is shown in the third pentad, which, perhaps, signifies that one has to have the virus themselves in order to relate completely to the goals of this project. Puryear spoke of every one of the goals of the project except raising money when he talked about why he made his own panel. Raising money, however, would seem to come as a result of making panels. For example, the book of letters is something that is sold for profit to aid the Memorial Quilt Project.

Puryear made the quilt to provide a remembrance to others and a healing or cathartic feeling to himself in showing how he felt about having this virus. He also was an activist. Puryear wanted to show that anyone could get the virus. He also wanted to help others, so he made the panel to show how young he was when he got the disease so that others would be educated that youth does not equal immortality.

The third research question asks if there is a difference in motivations when the quilt is made by different type of group or person. This question was the most interesting in this analysis. This study found that there is a significant difference among the groups. In the

first pentad, that involved either family or loved ones, the ratio Act-Purpose seemed to be the most dominant.

The Act-Purpose ratio shows that the making of the panel seems to have a cathartic effect for the person(s) who made the panel. Again, the letters asked many times how does one go about representing a life on a three by six foot piece of cloth? The Purpose of the Act in this case seems to be three-fold. The first Purpose is to commemorate the life of the person who died. The second Purpose is to mourn the death. The third Purpose is to ask why this happened in the first place.

This virus makes people feel helpless. There is no known cure. This panel makes loved ones feel that they accomplishing something. Even if they could not save their family member, friend, or lover, maybe they can save others by sharing the story of their loved one. Through this sharing, they are able to say good-bye.

This motive was very different from the next. This pentad spoke of the motivations behind a group of women who made the panel(s) for a stranger. The featured ratio in this pentadic analysis was Act-Agent. The panel, or any panel, would not have been created by this group if there had not been a request. If the group had not felt like they had to do it, the panel would not have been made. It is significant that the attitude was described as helpful and resentful.

Using Burke, one may argue that this group went through a period of guilt and redemption. Even though they did not have a personal investment, this group got a lot out of helping others.

These motivations are also different from the third pentad. To make your own death memorial has to be a hard task. What do you say about your whole life and death on a few feet of material? Duane Puryear chose to create his own memorial in order to educate and as a way of doing something about the disease.

Act-Agency was the most featured ratio in Puryear's pentad. The Agency is needle and thread in the case of Duane Puryear's panel. In committing this Act, with needle and thread, Puryear reidentified himself as not only someone with AIDS, but as someone who would die from AIDS.

This was also the first act that reidentified Puryear as an AIDS activist. He was not going to wait to die. Instead, he wanted to educate others and hope that someday he would not need this panel. He hoped that through education, there would come a cure.

The AIDS Quilt

It is easy to discern how the AIDS Quilt became the most recognizable national and international symbol of AIDS today. In studying the pentads, one must acknowledge that there are few other, if no other, memorials that are hand

created, in most cases, by loved ones and the victims of the virus themselves. Above all, this is a process by all involved. The process is the creation of a panel in a strict sense. It is also the process of healing in another sense.

While there may be different motivations behind the making of the panels it does have an effect on most people who view it and who make a panel. For families and victims, who make panels, it seems to have cathartic impact, similar to the impact most quilters feel when making a quilt in times of personal crises.

For strangers, such as the quilting group I became involved in, it is the process of education. Most of these women were not too thrilled that their hobby was now also a symbol for a social disease. In fact, I found out later that one of the women charged for the panel the same as she would a normal project. While they sometimes felt resentful in being asked to create panels, however, some also became more educated and thoughtful about this virus and the people who have died or are living with this disease.

For Duane Puryear, the making of a panel for the AIDS Quilt was a way to say "good-bye, but do not expect me to go quietly." For Puryear, this project was a way of accepting that he had this virus and that it was normally fatal. After he completed the panel, Puryear went on to other things. Moreover, this panel was a way of beginning his destiny as an AIDS Activist.

Theoretical Implications of the Study

Potentially this study has significance for students of Burkean Pentadic Analysis. This study not only adds to existing literature focusing on AIDS and the AIDS Quilt, but also adds to the existing literature that examines the work of Kenneth Burke and the Dramatistic Pentad. This analysis not only addresses the question of how the AIDS Quilt is made, but also addresses the relationship between the motivations and symbols used in the age of the AIDS Quilt.

It is necessary to discuss what the findings of the study can tell us about the AIDS Quilt as an artifact, and about the making of the panels as a stage in the process to fight the ignorance that is still abundant about this virus. By examining how the panels are made, it may be possible to better understand how new symbols are created, particularly symbols that are controversial. In the case of the AIDS Quilt Panels symbols that are ambiguous (i.e. specifically spelling out how one did not die as a result of homosexual sexual relations). Hopefully, this study and future studies will continue to contribute to the knowledge that is ending the prejudice and the misunderstandings against those who have contracted this virus.

Limitations and Future Research

The limitations of this study were largely in the third pentad. While the analysis of Duane Puryear's panel was thought provoking, a stronger analysis might have included

interviews from several people who are making panels for themselves during this time period. Unfortunately, it is quite easy to find people who have this virus. It was not easy, however, to find someone who was making their own panel. Most people I talked to did not want to even talk about it. It is rare to be able to analyze an artifact like Duane Puryear's Quilt Panel and his motives in his process of creating it. Therefore, it was appropriate to do this pentad even with limited data.

This leads to future research options. In the future, it would be interesting to see a study of people who are living with HIV or AIDS who are making or who have made their own panels. This study would include all people, not just homosexual men. While time consuming, this would add to this study a richer database from which to draw motivations.

Another avenue for research is an analysis of the panels themselves. The NAMES Project in San Francisco has created an archive of every single panel. In the future, one will be able to access pictures and letters of every panel so far created on C.D. for the computer. With this rich data base, one can either analyze different groups, such as mothers, lesbians, children... or do an analysis of the entire project.

Conclusion

The study of the AIDS Quilt and the NAMES Project is relatively a new one. Most of the analyses of this artifact have focused on a small selection of panels or the group behind the project. This is the first study that focuses on the motivations behind the panels themselves.

This analysis has effectively answered why the three different groups of people: loved ones; quilters; and a victim, choose to be a part of this highly emotional project. In all three pentads, the Act or the making of the panel was important to the motivations behind it, while Purpose was important to loved ones, Agent was important to the quilters, and Agency was important to Duane Puryear.

What would it be like to know when you are going to die? What would it be like to make your own memorial? Duane Puryear answered these questions, when he made his own panel for the AIDS Quilt. Hopefully, someday the idea of someone making their own or any panel for the AIDS Quilt will not be a variable in a study, but a lesson in history.

References

- Atkins, J.M. (1994). Shared Threads: Quilting Together-Past and Present. New York, NY: Viking Studio Books.
- Benoit, W.L. (1994). The genesis of rhetorical action. The Southern Communication Journal, 59 (4), 342-353.
- Birdsell, D.S. (1987). Ronald Reagan on Lebanon and Grenada: Flexibility and interperatation in the application of Kenneth Burke. The Quarterly Journal of Speech, 73 (3), 267-279.
- Blair, C. (1995). Symbolic action and discourse: The convergent/divergent views of Kenneth Burke and Michel Foucault. In Brock, B.L. (Ed.). Kenneth Burke and Contemporary European Thought. Tuscaloosa, AL: The University of Alabama Press (pp.119-156).
- Brock, B.L. (1985). Epistemology and ontology in Kenneth Burke's dramatism. Communication Quarterly, 33 (2), 94-104.
- Brock, B.L. (ed.). (1995). Kenneth Burke and Contemporary European Thought. Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama Press.
- Brock, B.L. (1992). The limits of the Burkian system. Quarterly Journal of Speech, 18 (3), 347-348.
- Brown, J. (ed.). (1992). A Promise to Remember: The NAMES Project Book of Letters. New York: Avon Press.
- Burke, K. (1937). Attitudes Toward History. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Burke, K. (1945). A Grammar of Motives. Englewood: Prentice Hall, Inc.

Burke, K. (1931). Counter-Statement. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Burke, K. (1968). Dramatism. in Sills, D.L. (Ed.). The Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences. New York: Macmillan.

Burke, K. (1966). Language as Symbolic Action: Essays on Life, Literature, and Method. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Burke, K. (1935). Permanence and Change. Los Altos: Hermes.

Burke, K. (1941). The Philosophy of Literary Form. Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press.

Burke, K. (1950). A Rhetoric of Motives. New York: Prentice Hall, Inc.

Burke, K. (1961). The Rhetoric of Religion. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Carlson, A.C. (1989). Narrative as the philosopher's stone: How Russell H. Conwell changed lead into diamonds. Western Journal of Speech Communication, 53, 342-355.

Chesebro, J.W. (1992). Extensions of the Burkian system. Quarterly Journal of Speech, 53, 356-368.

Collins, C.A., & Clark, J.E. (1992). Jim Wright's resignation speech: De-legitimization or redemption? The Southern Communication Journal, 58 (1), 67-76.

Condit, C.M. (1992). Post-Burke: Transcending the substance of dramatism. Quarterly Journal of Speech, 78, 349-355.

Conrad, C., & Macom, E.A. (1995). Re-Visiting Kenneth Burke: Dramatism/Logology and the problem of agency. The Southern Communication Journal, 61 (1), 10-28.

Cooks, L., & Descutner, D. (1993). Different paths from powerlessness to empowerment: A dramatic analysis of two eating disorder therapies. Western Journal of Speech Communication, 57, 494-514.

Cross, M.B. (1996). Quilts and Women of the Mormon Migrations: Treasures of Transition. Nashville, TN: Rutledge Hill Press.

Finley, R. E. (1929). Old Patchwork Quilts and The Women Who Made Them. Philadelphia, PA: J.B. Lippincott Company.

Fisher, J.Y. (1974). A Burkian analysis of the rhetorical dimensions of a multiple murder and suicide. The Quarterly Journal of Speech, 60 (2), 175-189.

Foss, K.A., & Foss, S.K. (1991). Women Speak: The Eloquence of Women's Lives. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, Inc.

Foss, S.K., Foss, K.A., & Trapp, R. (1985). Contemporary Perspectives on Rhetoric. Prospect Heights: Waveland Press, Inc.

Foss, S.K. (1989). Rhetorical Criticism: Exploitations and Practice. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press.

Goodall, H.L. (1994). Casing a Promised Land: The Autobiography of an Organizational Detective as Cultural Ethnographer. Carbondale: Southern University Press.

Griffin, C.L. (1995). Teaching rhetorical criticism with Thelma and Louise. Communication Education, 44, 165-176.

Harris, D. (1994). Making kitsch from AIDS. Harper's, 289, 55-60.

Hickling, C.J.A. (1993). The agency of the apostle: A dramatic analysis of Paul's responses to the conflict in 2 Corntnthians. The Journal of Theological Studies, 44 (1), 285-289.

Howe, L. (1997). The AIDS Quilt and its traditions. College Literature, 24, 109-24.

Jones, R.A. (1985). Research Methods in the Social and Behavioral Sciences. Massachusetts: Sinaur, Inc.

Kelley, C.E. (1987). The 1984 campaign rheotoric of Representative George Hansen: a pentadic analysis. Western Journal of Speech Communication, 51 (2), 204-217.

Kerewsky, S.D. (1997) HIV+ Gay Mens Processess of Making Their Own AIDS Memorial Quilt Panels. Dissertation Abstracts International.

Krouse, M.E. (1997). Gift Giving and Social Transformation: The AIDS Memorial Quilt as a Social Movement. Dissertation Abstracts International.

Ling, D.A. (1970). A pentadic analysis of Senator Edward Kennedy's address to the people of Massachusetts. Central States Speech Journal, 21 (2), 81-86.

Mayo, M.M. A Cultural Analysis of the Meanings in the NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt. Dissertation Abstracts International.

McPhail, M.L. (1995). Coherence as representative anecdote in the rhetorics of Kenneth Burke and Ernesto Grassi. in Brock, B.L. (Ed.). Kenneth Burke and Contemporary European Thought. Tuscaloosa, AL: The University of Alabama Press.

Mills, M. (1998). Exploitation of the Obedience Paradigm in Asian and South American Cultures: A Pentadic Analysis of an ESL Scandal. Unpublished Manuscript.

Mindel, F.M. The Rhetoric of AIDS Activism: A Burkean Analysis of the NAMES Project and ACT UP. Dissertation Abstracts International.

One Woman, One Vote. 1995. PBS Video.

Scott, R.L., & Brock, B.L. (1972). Methods of Rhetorical Criticism: A Twentieth Century Perspective. New York: Harper & Row.

Swartz, U. (1995). Kenneth Burke's theory of form: Rhetoric, art and cultural criticism. The Southern Communication Journal, 61 (4), 312-321.